



# INPUT EVALUATION IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE IN-SERVICE TEACHER PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION CURRICULUM

Risa Zakiatul Hasanah<sup>1</sup>
<sup>1</sup>Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia
\*rzakiatul@gmail.com

### **ABSTRACT**

One of the important processes in curriculum development is curriculum evaluation. Besides measuring the achievement of objectives, curriculum evaluation also aims to provide considerations and recommendations on whether a program should be improved, replaced, reduced, or added to. The purpose of this study is to determine the quality of inputs in the implementation of the In-Service Teacher Professional Education curriculum, particularly in the field of primary education at Indonesia University of Education located in West Java Province. This research is a qualitative evaluative study and employs the Stufflebeam evaluation model. The research primarily focuses on the input aspect, which is one of the components of the Stufflebeam evaluation framework (Context, Input, Process, and Product). Data collection methods used included interviews and observations. The input components examined include students and lecturers. Based on the conducted research, it can be concluded that the input aspect in the implementation of the In-Service Teacher Professional Education curriculum at Indonesia University of Education is aligned with the established criteria, but there are some recommendations to improve the deficiencies.

**Keywords:** input evaluation, curriculum, in-service teacher professional education.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Teachers play a significant role in determining the quality of education in Indonesia. This role is associated with competence, professionalism, and understanding of the curriculum and content or material. The government employs various methods to improve the quality of teachers in Indonesia. This is as stated in the Teachers and Lecturers Law, which declares that teachers can be formally recognized as professional personnel if they have: four teaching competencies, a minimum academic qualification level of Bachelor's degree or equivalent, participate in the Teacher Professional Education (PPG) program to enhance teaching quality, and this is evidenced by an educator certificate.

The educator certificate is one formal proof that teachers are recognized as professional personnel by both the government and the social community environment. The educator certificate is awarded to teachers after meeting requirements, including the condition of undergoing education. The process of granting an educator certificate to teachers after participating in education and learning stages is called the certification process (Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 37 of 2017). Certification itself has been implemented since 2007 through a series of mechanisms to obtain it. It was only from 2018 to the present that certification is carried out through the In-Service Teacher Professional Education (PPG) program.

The learning process in the In-Service Teacher Professional Education (PPG) program differs from learning in formal education, such as a Bachelor's degree or equivalent, because this program is specifically designed to achieve the standard graduate competencies of the teaching profession (Guidelines for the Implementation of PPG In-Service, 2020). The government's expectations for teachers upon completing the In-Service PPG program include mastering the material comprehensively and in-depth; mastering educational science, development, and guiding students; mastering the learning of subject areas, learning and evaluation, planning, and learning media; possessing integrity of personality; and having the ability to establish good social relationships both directly and through media.

To determine whether a program has been effective, it is necessary to evaluate the curriculum and the program itself. Previous research conducted by Triwinarni (2017) showed that there are still many components that are not maximized in the implementation of the Teacher Professional Education (PPG) program. However, that study did not touch on the components of lecturers and students, hence there is a need for an input evaluation related to lecturers and students of the In-Service teacher professional education program. Furthermore, this study



is also necessary to complement the previous study conducted by Wahyudin (2016). The previous study evaluated the readiness of UPI (Indonesia University of Education) in terms of managerial aspects and the role of leadership in the implementation of the In-Service Teacher Professional Education (PPG) program, while the aspects of lecturers and students were not further discussed. Therefore, to bring novelty in the field of curriculum evaluation, especially the input aspects (lecturers and teachers), this study needs to be carried out.

Another reason this research needs to be conducted is to assess the extent to which the curriculum of the in-service teacher professional education program aligns with standards. This involves evaluating whether the current curriculum is effective in preparing teachers with the necessary teaching competencies. Additionally, in the input evaluation, this study is also necessary to assess the qualifications and effectiveness of lecturers and the readiness of students to participate in the program. This relates to the resources available for the program. Addressing these issues through comprehensive evaluation can help in identifying areas for improvement, and ensure that the PPG program, specifically in terms of input components, has been effective and efficient and contributes to the professional development of teachers.

### 2. METHODS

The approach utilized in this research is qualitative with a descriptive evaluative method. Evaluative research is applied not to answer a question but to determine the effectiveness of implementing a program. The evaluation model employed is the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model, first proposed by Stufflebeam. According to Stufflebeam (1960) in Stufflebeam and Zahang (2017), there are four components that can be evaluated in a program: context, input, process, and product. In this study, the research focus is more on the input aspect. Qualitative research is more open and continuously evolves according to field conditions. Studies conducted measure more in-depth rather than breadth of the subject. The results are presented in the form of descriptions or words rather than numbers.

Data collection is done using interview and observation techniques. One of the characteristics of evaluative research is the existence of criteria or standards used to measure program achievement (Hasan, 2014). Criteria serve as guidelines in evaluation to measure the level of achievement (Arikunto & Jabar, 2008). Criteria can also serve as standards in evaluation to avoid subjectivity. There are specific approaches in using evaluation criteria including Pre-ordinate, fidelity, and mutual adaptive (Hasan, 2014). In this research, fidelity is used. In the fidelity approach, criteria or standards originate from the development of the curriculum's characteristics itself.

Table 1. The Research Instrument Framework

Table 1. The Research Instrument Planework					
Aspect	Component	Sub-Component	Criteria	Data Source	
Aspect  Input (Input)	Component Lecturer	a. Number of in-service teacher education program (PPG) instructors at UPI b. Procedure for the recruitment of PPG instructors c. Criteria for becoming an in-service teacher	Pedoman penyelenggaraan PPG Dalam Jabatan (2020)	The leader of PPG, PGSD Study Field Coordinator	
		education (PPG) instructor			



## PROCEEDINGS OF INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON EDUCATION TEACHER TRAINING & EDUCATION FACULTY UNIVERSITAS SERAMBI MEKKAH NO. ISSN 2987-4564

tudents	a.	Number	of	student	a.	Permendikbud No. 38 The leader of	
		quotas				tahun 2020 tentang PPG,	
	b.	Students'	ed	ucational		Tata cara memperoleh PGSD Study	
		background	ds			sertifikat pendidik Field	
	c.	Student sel	ection	n criteria	b.	Pedoman Coordinator,	
						penyelenggaraan PPG Lecturer	
						Dalam Jabatan (2020)	

The data obtained is then analyzed using data reduction techniques. Data is reduced by selection, focus, simplification, abstraction, and transcription from audio to text form (Miles & Huberman in Sugiyono, 2017). The data reduction technique aims to focus the research data on relevant matters and eliminate irrelevant aspects in this study. After data reduction, the data is presented and organized into descriptive form so that the information is easily understood by the readers. In the final stage, the researcher draws conclusions. This is done to follow up on the results of the input evaluation that has been completed.

### 3. RESULTS & DISCUSSION

#### 3.1 Results

Based on the study conducted, it is known that there are 27 in-service elementary school teacher education lecturers at Indonesia University of Education (UPI), including lecturers at regional campuses. Out of this total, 10 lecturers teach subject matter deepening courses, 3 lecturers teach instructional material development courses, and 3 lecturers are assigned to field experience practice (PPL) courses. These lecturers can also take on additional tasks according to their expertise. Regarding the distribution of lecturer duties, some lecturers in one cohort teach two courses, while others teach all three. However, some lecturers only teach one course. This is determined based on the schedule and the lecturer's capability. Based on interview results, it is known that there have been no scheduling conflicts among lecturers during the in-service PPG program. This indicates that the schedule prepared by the PPG educational staff is adequate and accommodates all PPG lecturer activities. Additionally, UPI has never faced a shortage of lecturers for the in-service PPG program due to having sufficient resources.

The procedure for hiring lecturers at Indonesia University of Education (UPI) is closed, meaning recruitment is only conducted by the campus and is aimed at lecturers teaching within the UPI environment, not open to the public. PPG lecturers at UPI are selected from existing lecturers, and the programs and courses they teach are tailored to the fields of study offered in the In-Service Teacher Training Program. The Elementary School Teacher Education (PGSD) field of study not only accepts lecturers with a PGSD educational background but also from other fields such as Mathematics Education, Indonesian Language, Natural Sciences, Social Sciences, Civic Education, Guidance Counseling, or Psychology. This is because these fields are also taught to inservice Elementary School Teacher Training Program students.

"Yes, the recruitment of PPG lecturers is not open to the public. They utilize lecturers from the relevant departments, including all departments. However, for Elementary School Teacher Education, because there are subjects beyond that such as Indonesian Language and Civic Education, they may request lecturers from outside the department but still within the campus scope." (Respondent 1, interview: April 1, 2022).

Because the subjects in the Elementary School Teacher Education Program are not exclusively from the Elementary School Teacher Education department, the lecturers teaching these subjects are not necessarily from the PGSD department either. In such cases, the PPG Program will recruit lecturers from across faculties. The procedure involves coordinating with other departments needed to teach in the PPG Program. The relevant lecturers are designated by the study field coordinator and the head of the PPG program. According to Respondent 2, among the many criteria or requirements to become an in-service PPG lecturer, the most important



### PROCEEDINGS OF INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON EDUCATION TEACHER TRAINING & EDUCATION FACULTY UNIVERSITAS SERAMBI MEKKAH

NO. ISSN 2987-4564

criterion is having a lecturer certificate. Additionally, PPG lecturers must have reached a certain functional position, have teaching experience, and have supervised field experience practices (PPL).

"There are official regulations issued by the Teacher and Education Personnel Certification (GTK) regarding the requirements to become an in-service PPG instructor, and we adhere to them. So, the first requirement that must be fulfilled is the educator certificate." (Respondent 2, interview: January 26, 2022).

This is further reinforced by the opinion of Respondent 1, who stated that a crucial requirement to become a PPG lecturer is to have an educator certificate. As for teaching experience in elementary schools, it is not heavily considered for PPG lecturers because they focus more on theoretical exposition while practical teaching is conducted by supervising teachers. Based on interviews and field observations, it is known that there are not many in-service PPG lecturers at Indonesia University of Education who have previously taught in schools.

To determine the student quota at UPI, the head of the PPG program will first consider the number of lecturers and the number of study groups to be provided. Once determined, UPI will report this information to the Directorate of Teachers and Educational Personnel (Dirjen GTK). Based on this, GTK establishes the student admission quota at each LPTK (Institute of Education and Teacher Training) and aggregates them on a national scale. In UPI, each study group consists of 30-35 students, and there are 2 classes offered in the PGSD field of study. However, since UPI has 5 branch campuses or regional campuses, the total number of study groups available is 12, allowing UPI to accommodate a total of 630 students specializing in the PGSD field of study in one intake.

There are differences in opinion between Respondent 2 and 4 regarding the educational background of students in the In-Service Primary Teacher Education Program (PPG SD). Respondent 2 stated that at UPI, there have been students from non-Education majors.

"There are (non-education majors), because the initial selection from GTK deemed them equivalent, so they were allowed to participate in the In-Service PPG SD. So, in one class, there are definitely non-Education majors." (Respondent 2, interview: January 26, 2022).

On the other hand, Respondent 4 stated that they have never encountered non-Education majors at UPI.

"So far, what I have found are mostly graduates from Education majors, whether by coincidence or not, in all classes and batches, almost all those in-service are indeed from Education majors." (Respondent 4, interview: April 20, 2022).

To verify this, a study was conducted on one batch of the In-Service PPG SD in 2022, and the results showed all students were from Education majors. Regarding this matter, according to government regulations, students from non-Education majors are allowed to enroll in the In-Service PPG SD Program. The condition where all students have an Education background makes it easier for lecturers to deliver teaching materials, and the likelihood of encountering problems related to students' understanding is small because all students already have specific competencies based on the same educational background.

Furthermore, the government also regulates the placement system for In-Service PPG students, so students cannot choose the campus where they will carry out the PPG. This means the placement of In-Service PPG students is random. Regarding this matter, there is no policy clearly stated, and respondents do not know the exact policy.

"Actually, I don't really know the exact policy; what's clear is that there's no prioritization based on the student's region of origin." (Respondent 1, interview: April 1, 2022).

Therefore, every teacher from any region has the same opportunity for PPG as a government effort to equalize the quality of teachers in Indonesia. Related to this, there are still many debates. As stated by Respondent 2, they disagreed if the placement system for In-Service PPG students is random and should prioritize students from the local area due to factors of effectiveness and efficiency. Meanwhile, Respondent 1 agrees that the placement of PPG students should utilize a random system, in order to avoid practices of injustice and to prevent the emergence of new, regionally-based problems. Additionally, the zoning system cannot standardize the graduation criteria for teachers because the conditions of teachers and the Institutions (LPTK) vary across different areas. For example, teachers in DKI Jakarta are generally accustomed to using technological devices,



while those in other regions may not be, resulting in higher acceptance standards for students in DKI Jakarta compared to other areas. Therefore, according to Respondent 1, to equalize the standard of teacher competencies and apply the principle of fairness, what the government is implementing is appropriate.

### 3.2 Discussion

The government has regulated and set standards for individuals to qualify as PPG lecturers. In the Guidelines for the Implementation of In-Service PPG (2020, p. 57), it is explained that the requirements to become a PPG lecturer include having a minimum qualification of a master's degree, having an educational background relevant to the field of study being taught, possessing an educator certificate, being assigned by the university leader, and preferably having teaching experience in schools. Based on these criteria, it can be determined that there is no discrepancy between the government's regulations and the conditions in the field. The PPG lecturers at UPI already have educator certificates, and other requirements are also fulfilled.

In the Guidelines for the Professional Teacher Education Program (2020, p. 58), it is clearly stated that one of the requirements to become an in-service PPG lecturer is that priority is given to those who have teaching experience in schools, and this point is separate from the point about lecturer certification. Meanwhile, according to Law Number 14 of 2005 concerning Teachers and Lecturers, Article 47 paragraph 1 states that an educator certificate for lecturers is granted when they meet the requirement of having at least 2 years of work experience as an educator at a Higher Education Institution.

In this case, there is a discrepancy between the respondent's understanding and the regulations outlined in the Guidelines for the Implementation of In-Service PPG (2020). The teaching experience specified in the lecturer certification refers to teaching experience at Higher Education Institutions and not teaching experience in schools. However, the teaching experience for lecturers mentioned in the guidelines for the implementation of in-service PPG refers to teaching experience in schools, which serves as an additional point for in-service PPG lecturers if they have it. It is important to differentiate between teaching experience as a requirement for lecturer certification and teaching experience mentioned in the guidelines for the implementation of in-service PPG. Therefore, teaching experience in schools should also be considered as an additional point during the recruitment of inservice PPG lecturers.

Teaching experience in schools is one of the crucial criteria that must be possessed by in-service Elementary School Teacher Education (PPG SD Dalam Jabatan) lecturers because lecturers need to comprehend not only the theoretical aspects but also the practical aspects in the field. It is not just supervising teachers who must master the practical aspects in schools but also lecturers. This ensures that what is conveyed can be more applicable because lecturers themselves have experienced teaching in elementary schools. Supervising teachers provide reinforcement and assist in accompanying lecturers to provide deeper practical experiences, especially in Field Experience Practice (PPL) courses.

Table 2. The Comparison of Findings and Criteria of Lecturers

Lecturers							
Sub-Components	Findings	Criteria	Conformity				
Number of in-service	UPI has 27 certified lecturers	The management of PPG at the	The finding is in				
teacher education program		Teacher Training and	accordance with the				
(PPG) instructors at		Education Institution (LPTK)	criteria.				
Indonesia University of		must have a minimum of 6					
Education		lecturers, comprising 2 lecturers					
		with a minimum qualification					
		of a doctoral degree (S3) and 4					
		lecturers with a master's degree					
		qualification.					
Procedure for the	Lecturers recruitment is only	Got an assignment from the	The finding is in				
recruitment of PPG	conducted by the campus and is	college leader to be the	accordance with the				
instructors	aimed at lecturers teaching	manager of the PPG study field.	criteria.				



### PROCEEDINGS OF INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON EDUCATION TEACHER TRAINING & EDUCATION FACULTY UNIVERSITAS SERAMBI MEKKAH

NO. ISSN 2987-4564

	within the UPI environment		
Criteria for becoming an	All criteria are met, but without	Preference is given to lecturers	The finding is in
in-service teacher	considering teaching	who have experience teaching	accordance with the
education (PPG)	experience in schools.	in schools	criteria, but there is
instructor	_		specific notes.

An in-service teacher, according to the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture Regulation Number 38 of 2020, is a civil servant teacher or a non-civil servant teacher who has been teaching in educational units organized by the central government, regional government, or educational organizing communities that have an agreement or joint work agreement. The recruitment of in-service PPG (Teacher Professional Education Program) students is conducted directly by the central government. The criteria that must be met to qualify as an in-service PPG student include: holding a Bachelor's degree or equivalent, being an in-service teacher appointed up until December 2015, being registered in the primary education data, having a NUPTK (Unique Number for Teachers and Education Personnel), and having completed the required documents.

The acceptance of new in-service PPG (Teacher Professional Education Program) students at UPI does not reveal any discrepancies with government regulations, because the selection and admission of in-service PPG students are fully entrusted to the central government. UPI simply receives the list of names of students who will study there.

In the Indonesian Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education Regulation No. 55 of 2017 concerning Teacher Education Standards, Article 24 paragraph 5, it is mentioned that a PPG (Teacher Professional Education Program) class should consist of no more than 20 participants. Meanwhile, in the guidelines for the implementation of the In-Service PPG (2020, p. 26), it is stated that a PPG in-service class group can consist of up to 35 individuals. Based on interviews with respondents in the field, UPI is capable of accommodating 30-35 students in one learning group. This indicates that UPI has implemented the in-service PPG program in accordance with government regulations and no discrepancies have been found.

However, the issue arises from the government's policy regulations being inconsistent with one another. The standard education policy for teachers is used as a reference in the guidelines for the implementation of the In-Service PPG (Teacher Professional Education Program), yet their contents do not align. Ideally, one policy should reinforce and be coherent with others, preventing the emergence of new perceptions in the field. The government must exercise greater wisdom in formulating policies to ensure that no discrepancies arise between them.

The government has declared that several majors aligned with Elementary School Teacher Education (PGSD) include Islamic Elementary Teacher Education (PGMI), Civic Education (PKn), Mathematics Education, Indonesian Language Education, Indonesian Education and Literature, Indonesian Language and Regional Education, Science (IPA) / Social Studies (IPS) Education, Indonesian Language Teaching (Tadris Bahasa Indonesia), Science (IPA) / Social Studies (IPS) Teaching (Tadris IPA/IPS), and Mathematics Teaching (Tadris Matematika). Consequently, in-service PPG (Teacher Professional Education Program) students for elementary education are not limited to those from the PGSD major alone but also include those from other related majors. This policy has sparked considerable debate among academics, with both supporters and opponents expressing their views.

Respondents 1 and 2 agree in their disagreement with the government's decision to allow majors other than Elementary School Teacher Education (PGSD) to be accepted into the in-service PPG (Teacher Professional Education Program). Their reasoning is that PGSD graduates are specifically prepared to become teachers, with their Bachelor's education aligning closely with this goal. This contrasts with other majors, which are prepared to teach specific subjects at the secondary school level. However, the government has determined that other majors can enroll in the in-service PPG for elementary education because these fields of study are still related to subjects taught in elementary schools. Additionally, there are significant obstacles in various regions in appointing teachers with a Bachelor's degree in PGSD due to their limited number, leading the government to recruit teachers from other majors rather than hiring those who fall below the standards set by the UUGD.



Meanwhile, the government's implementation of a random placement system for students, directly managed by the central government, is considered appropriate due to several considerations. First, there is no specific affirmation for students originating from the zones of the Teacher Education and Training Institutions (LPTKs) hosting the program. Second, the zoning system in the in-service Teacher Professional Education Program (PPG) would lead to unfair practices and spark new regional issues, while the examination uses the same graduation standards. Third, it could encourage dishonest practices in regions. If there are still vacancies, students who were not accepted might lobby local governments for approval, potentially leading to fraudulent practices. Fourth, the zoning system does not equalize graduation standards due to varying conditions of teachers in different areas. Fifth, it eliminates national teacher standards because it is based on regional implementation. Sixth, it creates competition between regions and division.

Table 3. The Comparison of Findings and Criteria of Students

Table 5. The Comparison of Findings and Criteria of Students						
Students						
<b>Sub-Components</b>		Findings	Criteria	Conformity		
Number	of student	30-35 students in one	Permenristekdikti No. 55 of 2017 on Teacher	The finding is in		
quotas		class.	Education Standards, Article 24 paragraph 5,	accordance with the		
			states: a Teacher Professional Education	criteria, but there are		
			Program (PPG) class should consist of no	specific notes.		
			more than 20 participants.			
			The 2020 guidelines for the Teacher			
			Professional Education Program (PPG) state			
			that one learning group can have a maximum			
			of 35 people.			
Students'	educational	On average, they come	The government allows students from other	The finding is in		
backgrounds from the		from the Elementary	majors to enroll in the in-service Elementary	accordance with the		
		School Teacher	School Teacher Professional Education	criteria, but there are		
		Education program	Program (PPG SD).	specific		
		(PGSD), and no		recommendations.		
		students from other				
		majors have been				
		found.				
Student	selection	Some agree with the	The government has established a rule for	The finding is in		
criteria		government's policy,	placing in-service Elementary School	accordance with the		
		while others do not.	Teacher Professional Education Program	criteria, but it is still		
			(PPG SD) students randomly.	debatable.		

### 4. CONCLUSION

The evaluation of inputs conducted on two components, namely lecturers and students, indicates conformity with standards or criteria. Three subcomponents for lecturers, which are the number of lecturers, the procedure for lecturer recruitment, and the criteria for becoming an in-service PPG (Teacher Professional Education) lecturer, are already in accordance with the criteria. However, there is a special note for the subcomponent of the PPG lecturer criteria, which is the additional points for in-service lecturers who have previously taught in schools. As for the three student subcomponents, which are the number of students, educational background, and student placement, they are already in line with the standards. However, there is a special note regarding the educational background of in-service PPG students, which ideally should come from Primary School Teacher Education (PGSD), and the issue that still provokes debate is the random placement of students.

### 5. ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We would like to express our deepest appreciation to all those who provided us the possibility to complete this research. A special gratitude we give to our project advisor, Prof. Dr. H. Said Hamid Hasan, M.A (alm), who



### PROCEEDINGS OF INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON EDUCATION TEACHER TRAINING & EDUCATION FACULTY UNIVERSITAS SERAMBI MEKKAH

NO. ISSN 2987-4564

contributed in stimulating suggestions and encouragement, helped us to coordinate our project especially in writing this paper. Furthermore, we would also like to acknowledge the invaluable support and guidance provided by Dr. H. Zainal Arifin, M.Pd, from Indonesia University of Education, whose insights and expertise significantly enhanced the quality of our work. Lastly, we would like to show our gratitude to the Indonesia University of Education for providing the necessary facilities and resources for our research. This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

### REFERENCES

- Arikunto & Jabar. (2008). Evaluasi Program Pendidikan: Pedoman Teoretis Praktis bagi Mahasiswa dan Praktisi Pendidikan. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara
- Direktorat Jenderal Guru dan Tenaga Kependidikan. (2020). *Pedoman Program Pendidikan Profesi Guru Dalam Jabatan*. Sekretariat Negara: Jakarta
- Direktorat Jenderal Pembelajaran dan Kemahasiswaan. (2018). *Pedoman Penyelenggaraan Program Pendidikan Profesi Guru*. Sekretariat Negara: Jakarta.
- Hasan, S.H. (2014). Evaluasi Kurikulum. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Indonesian government. (2007). Regulation of the Minister of National Education of the Republic of Indonesia Number 16 of 2007 concerning Academic Qualification Standards and Teacher Competencies. State Secretariat: Jakarta.
- Indonesian Government. (2008). Regulation of the Minister of National Education of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18 of 2007 concerning Certification for In-Service Teachers. State Secretariat: Jakarta.
- Indonesian Government. (2009). Regulation of the Minister of National Education of the Republic of Indonesia Number 19 of 2009 concerning Certification for In-Service Teachers. State Secretariat: Jakarta.
- Indonesian Government. (2010). Regulation of the Minister of National Education of the Republic of Indonesia Number 9 of 2010 concerning Professional Teacher Education Programs for In-Service Teachers. State Secretariat: Jakarta.
- Indonesian Government. (2011). Regulation of the Minister of National Education of the Republic of Indonesia Number 11 of 2011 concerning Certification for In-Service Teachers. State Secretariat: Jakarta.
- Indonesian Government. (2017). Minister of Research, Technology and Higher Education Regulation Number 55 of 2017 concerning Teacher Education Standards. State Secretariat: Jakarta.
- Indonesian government. (2017). Government Regulation Number 19 of 2017 concerning Amendments to Government Regulation Number 74 of 2008 concerning Teachers. State Secretariat: Jakarta.
- Stufflebeam & Zhang. (2017). The CIPP Evaluation Model: How to Evaluate for Improvement and Accountability. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Sugiyono. (2017). Metode Penelitian Kualitatif: Untuk Penelitian yang Bersifat Eksploratorif, enterpretif, interaktif, dan konstruktif. Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta.
- Triwinarni, E. (2017). Evaluasi program Pendidikan Profesi Guru (PPG) Pendidikan Agama Islam di UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta. In *Prosiding Interdisciplinary Postgraduate Student Conference* (pp. 219-223).
- Wahyudin, D. (2016). Manajemen kurikulum dalam pendidikan profesi guru (Studi kasus di Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia). *Jurnal Kependidikan: Penelitian Inovasi Pembelajaran*, 46(2), 259-270.